

Carmella Mantello
Mayor

Seamus Donnelly
Deputy Mayor



Randy Coburn
Commissioner of Planning

Randy.Coburn@troyny.gov
(518)279-7166

DRAFT

Planning Commission

433 River St., Ste. 5001
Troy, New York 12180

MEETING MINUTES

The Planning Commission of the City of Troy, New York, conducted a public meeting at **6:00 P.M. on Wednesday, May 15th, 2024**, in person for the Board and available via Zoom conferencing, to act upon the following requests, referred by the Bureau of Code Enforcement of the City of Troy, for review and approval.

6:05 pm – Meeting called to order.

Commissioners in Attendance

Roddy Yagan (RY), Suzanne Spellen (SS), Sara Wengert (SW), Warren Shaw (WS), James Rath (JR), William Comiskey (WC), Stephen Maples (SM)

Also, in Attendance

Richard Morrissey (Planning and Zoning Attorney), Eric Ferraro (Assistant Planner), Randy Coburn (Planning Commissioner), Russ Reeves (Executive Secretary)

Administrative Items

- Adoption of Meeting Minutes from April 17th, 2024, by resolution.
- Review of the River Walk project

- **B.C. Motions to: Adopt April meeting/hearing minutes** S.S. seconded.

	Absent	Yes	No	Abstain	Recused
Roddy Yagan		X			
Sara Wengert		X			
Suzanne Spellen		X			
Warren Shaw		X			
James Rath	X				
William Comiskey		X			
Stephen Maples		X			

- Motion to: Adopt April meeting/hearing minutes passed 6-0

Old Business

*Order of items shifted from agenda.

PLPC 2024 0016 – 624-626 Second Avenue (80.47-6-17) [MU-1/N-III]
Site Plan Review – SEQRA (unlisted)

The Applicant, Jermaine White, wishes to convert a former commercial building into multi family residential units. The project involves the elimination of rear additions and upgrades to the façade.

- Applicant presentation: By Adam Patella, Architect.
- Commissioner comments and questions to applicant:
 1. W.S. would like to see planters installed as a condition.

Written by Eric Ferraro, On Behalf of the Executive Secretary

Additional information regarding the above listed actions is available by contacting the Planning Commission's Assistant Planner, eric.ferraro@troyny.gov.

As required by the Americans with Disabilities Act, auxiliary aids and services are available upon request. Please give one-week advance notice for services needed.

- 2. S.M. addresses neighbor's concerns about a brick-lined hole in back yard.
- 3. S.S. would like to see a garbage corral constructed as a condition.
- 4. S.W. would like to see the grass area, finish graded/sloped for surface drainage to alley as a condition.
- Request for public comment:
 1. Cherry Harrison; neighbor – Against proposal
- Commissioner deliberation:
- Applicant response:
 1. Roof being fixed/replaced is part of this project. The building is currently stabilized.

- **S.M. Motions to:** Close public comment period **W.S. seconded.**

	Absent	Yes	No	Abstain	Recused
Roddy Yagan		X			
Sara Wengert		X			
Suzanne Spellen		X			
Warren Shaw		X			
James Rath	X				
William Comiskey		X			
Stephen Maples		X			

• **Motion to: Close public comment period passed 6-0**

- R.Y. Motions to: **Issue a negative declaration for SEORA** S.M. seconded.

X.1. Motions to: Issue a negative declaration for SEQRA		S.M. seconded.			
	Absent	Yes	No	Abstain	Recused
Roddy Yagan		X			
Sara Wengert		X			
Suzanne Spellen		X			
Warren Shaw		X			
James Rath	X				
William Comiskey		X			
Stephen Maples		X			

• Motion to: Issue a negative declaration for SEORA passed 6-0

- **S.W. Motions to:** Approve site plan with conditions: 1. Building mounted planters be provided on facade. 2. An enclosure for garbage bins is provisioned. 3. Grading of the grass area be identified on site plan to provide for surface drainage S.M. seconded.

	Absent	Yes	No	Abstain	Recused
Roddy Yagan		X			
Sara Wengert		X			
Suzanne Spellen		X			
Warren Shaw		X			
James Rath	X				
William Comiskey		X			
Stephen Margles		X			

- Motion to: Approve site plan with conditions: 1. Building mounted planters be provided on facade. 2. An enclosure for garbage bins is provisioned. 3. Grading of the grass area be identified on site plan to provide for surface drainage passed 6-0

PLPC 2024 0009 – 1819 Fifth Avenue (101.53-5-6) [DMU/DT I]

TEPC 2024 003 – 1819 Fifth Avenue (R) Sub-Division Review – SEORA (Type D)

The applicant, 1819 Fifth Avenue Associates, LLC, proposes to sub-divide one downtown mixed use parcel into two separate lots. Lot one will continue to be used for residential purposes and Lot 2 will continue to be a commercial office space. There will be no material differences to the existing structures or their uses.

- Applicant presentation: Lindsay Carr
- Commissioner comments and question to applicant:
 1. R.R. asks about the methodology behind drawing parcel lines.
- Request for public comment: No public comment.
- Commissioner deliberation:
 1. R.Y. →R.M. addresses easement consideration
 2. R.M. referrals to ZBA need to be made before completion of review. Discusses criteria for process.
- Applicant response:
 1. Responds to R.R. about parcel lines.
 2. Requests item to be tabled indefinitely.

- **S.M. Motions to: Issue a positive declaration for SEQRA** **S.S. seconded.**

	Absent	Yes	No	Abstain	Recused
Roddy Yagan		X			
Sara Wenger		X			
Suzanne Spellen		X			
Warren Shaw		X			
James Rath	X				
William Comiskey		X			
Stephen Maples		X			

- **Motion to: Issue a positive declaration for SEORA** passed 6-0

- **R.Y. Motions to:** Table item indefinitely **B.C. seconded.**

	Absent	Yes	No	Abstain	Recused
Roddy Yagan		X			
Sara Wengert		X			
Suzanne Spellen		X			
Warren Shaw		X			
James Rath	X				
William Comiskey		X			
Stephen Maples		X			

- **Motion to:** Table item indefinitely **passed 6-0**

PLPC 2024 0008 – 125 River Street (100.68-1-1./1) [DMU/DT II]

Site Plan Review – SEQRA (Type I)

The applicant, Taylor II, LLC, proposes to bring modernized 21st century accommodations into downtown Troy, and update the existing Taylor superblock to match the current city infrastructure by demolishing the existing building stock followed by the construction of 2 new buildings consisting of 308 residential units supplemented by 2,135 sq ft of ground floor commercial space.

- Applicant presentation: By Penrose, Troy Housing Authority and LaBella Associates.
- Commissioner comments and questions to applicant:
 1. Some cited concerns for color palette, frontage, and massing. TDMP also mentioned as potentially not addressing all traffic related subjects.
 2. Discussions surrounding parking and unexcavated areas beneath the buildings.
 3. R.Y. asks applicant to provide documentation surrounding use or non-use of unexcavated area as it pertains to applicants' decision to activate or not activate. Inquires into balconies.
 4. Variance discussion.
 5. W.S. asks for a roof plan as it relates to mechanicals for the next meeting.
- Request for public comment: No public comment

- Commissioner deliberation:
 1. R.Y. → R.R. asks for update on Front Street redesign.
- Applicant response:
 1. States they will look at additional features surrounding parking as it relates to proximity on site and outer lying areas.
 2. States that they will comply with R.Y.'s request to provide documentation and also look at balcony consideration.

- **S.M. Motions to: Declare the application Complete** **B.C. seconded.**

	Absent	Yes	No	Abstain	Recused
Roddy Yagan		X			
Sara Wengert		X			
Suzanne Spellen		X			
Warren Shaw		X			
James Rath	X				
William Comiskey		X			
Stephen Maples		X			

- **Motion to: Declare the application Complete** **passed 6-0**

- **B.C. Motions to: Table the meeting to June 18** **S.S. seconded.**

	Absent	Yes	No	Abstain	Recused
Roddy Yagan		X			
Sara Wengert		X			
Suzanne Spellen		X			
Warren Shaw		X			
James Rath	X				
William Comiskey		X			
Stephen Maples		X			

- **Motion to: Table the meeting to June 18** **passed 6-0**

PLPC 2023 0039 –1011 2nd Avenue (70.64-1-1, 70.56-1-6) [Planned Development District; by City Council Resolution]

Concept review of revised site plan – SEQRA (Type I)

The applicant, Starlight Development LLC, is proposing to construct 2 multifamily apartment buildings (175 units) with underground and surface parking, travel lanes, sidewalks, and a multiuse path on an undeveloped 11-acre parcel. Site enhancements include private connections to municipal water/sewer as well as on site stormwater management. The applicant has revised its site plan to meet concerns previously raised by the Commission and the public and is seeking further Commission and public feedback.

- Applicant presentation: Brian Osterhout of EDP Engineering and & Derek Gribulis of Cotler Architecture.
- Commissioner comments and questions to applicant:
 1. S.M. Acknowledges that this is a dramatic improvement/step forward. Still thinks there's room for improvement. Cites mass and intensity.
 2. S.W. Asks if applicant has performed a comprehensive tree survey.
 - Encourages applicant to relocate the retention basin from the south of the site.
 - Encourages a reevaluation of cul-de-sac.
 - Wonders if the pedestrian path can be reconnected to 2nd avenue sidewalk.
 - Recommends entire property to be lined with trees.
 3. B.C., W.S., S.S. Voice concerns.
 4. R.Y. Sees a lot of improvements to design and site layout. Looking for more site and material details. Explains points.
 - Happy to see more green space.

- Agrees with S.W. about connecting the trail and the cul-de-sac.
- Wants more detail on the kayak launch.
- Supports tree survey.
- Wants to understand project as it pertains to site topography (rock outcrops, where there will be fill, excavation, etc.)
- Request for public comment: Public comment period re-opened due to substantial design change.
 1. Jess Bennet – against.
 - In litigation with Troy City Council for SEQRA determination and zoning designation of PDD. Court Date in the 3rd Appellate division in Albany “sometime in September.”
 2. Linda – Against
 3. Micky – Against
 4. Kathy Gabbot – Against
 5. Daniel Morrissy – Against
 6. Rachel Carter – Against
 7. Alec Linde – Against
 8. Carson Oliver – Against
 9. Joan Rondo – Against
 10. Janet Null – Against
 11. David Banks – Against
 12. Sarah B., cofounder of Friends of the Mahicantuck – Against
 13. Monica Ouellette – Against
- Commissioner deliberation:
 1. R.R. provides update of project review after taking over the P.E. review.
 2. R.Y. → R.M. Wants to confirm that unless any of the quantifiable impacts were to be exceeded that were considered as part of the SEQRA evaluation, it would not re-open SEQRA.
 3. S.M. → R.Y. Asks for clarification on the degree of review that's being sought by the applicant.
- Applicant response:
 1. Responds to public comments.
 2. S.W. A survey of trees was produced by the engineering team.

S.W. Motions to:	Table item to June 18th PC hearing			S.M. seconded.	
	Absent	Yes	No	Abstain	Recused
Roddy Yagan		X			
Sara Wengert		X			
Suzanne Spellen		X			
Warren Shaw		X			
James Rath	X				
William Comiskey		X			
Stephen Maples		X			

- **Motion to:** Table item to June 18th PC hearing passed 6-0

New Business

PLPC 2024 0019 – Eddy’s Lane Residential Development (90.56-1-1.1) [MF/N-II]
Sketch Plan Conference for Site Plan Review – SEQRA (Type I)

The applicant, DF Acquisitions II, proposes to construct 12 buildings with a total of 92 residential units. Associated infrastructure necessary to provide the proposed development with municipal services of sanitary sewer and water will also be constructed along with necessary access and circulation.

- Applicant presentation: Nicholas Costa
- Commissioner comments and questions to applicant:
 1. R.M. Asks if a phase I environmental study has been conducted.
 2. Discussions ensue about parking, pedestrian connections and building/site density.

- Request for public comment: Public comment period not yet open.
- Commissioner deliberation:
 1. General acceptance of architecture.
- Applicant response:
 1. R.M. We're working on phase I and geotechnical report.

- **R.Y. Motions to: Declare PC as Lead Agency under SEQRA S.S. seconded.**

	Absent	Yes	No	Abstain	Recused
Roddy Yagan		X			
Sara Wengert		X			
Suzanne Spellen		X			
Warren Shaw		X			
James Rath	X				
William Comiskey		X			
Stephen Maples		X			

- **Motion to: Declare PC as Lead Agency under SEQRA passed 6-0**

- **R.Y. Motions to: Table item to the July 17th PC Hearing S.W. seconded.**

	Absent	Yes	No	Abstain	Recused
Roddy Yagan		X			
Sara Wengert		X			
Suzanne Spellen		X			
Warren Shaw		X			
James Rath	X				
William Comiskey		X			
Stephen Maples		X			

- **Motion to: Table item to the July 17th PC Hearing passed 6-0**

- **Review of the River Walk project**

- Applicant presentation: LaBella Associates
- Commissioner comments and questions:
 1. S.M. Wants more pedestrian connections. Cites Hoosick St. and transitions from Hutton St. and around the Marriot.
 - Suggests pedestrian connections from senior living apts and rock gym. "Having them take as few steps as possible to get onto the boardwalk."
 - Suggests signage to guide pedestrians from nearby streets and parking lots.
 2. R.Y. likes seating nodes on boardwalk. Would like to see more places to sit. "I'm wondering if there may be a couple spaces on the land side to bump inward into the vegetative strip with a little bay for a bench."
 - Covered benches would be nice.
 - Space for food vendors?
 - Opportunities for murals among treads
 - Provision of signage connected to river, industrial history, natural history, etc.
 3. S.W. Provide lots of garbage cans.
 4. W.S. coordinate with the arts center to incorporate their ideas and potentially some additional funding.
- Request for public comment: No public comment.
- Commissioner deliberation:
 1. Project is well received.
- Applicant response:

S.M. motioned to: Adjourn May PC hearing at: 10:39 PM R.Y. seconded.

	Absent	Yes	No	Abstain	Recused
Roddy Yagan		X			
Sara Wengert		X			
Suzanne Spellen		X			
Warren Shaw		X			
James Rath	X				
William Comiskey		X			
Stephen Maples		X			

Motion to: Adjourn the hearing at: 10:39 P.M. passed 6-0.

DRAFT